International and Foreign Legal Research: Tips, Tricks, and Sources

Linda Karr O'Connor

Follow this and additional works at: http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cilj

Part of the Law Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cilj/vol28/iss2/4

This Comment is brought to you for free and open access by Scholarship@Cornell Law: A Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Cornell International Law Journal by an authorized administrator of Scholarship@Cornell Law: A Digital Repository. For more information, please contact jmp8@cornell.edu.
RESEARCH ESSAY

Linda Karr O'Connor *

International and Foreign Legal Research: Tips, Tricks, and Sources

I. Basic Principles and Sources ........................................ 418
II. Background Resources ............................................. 420
III. Foreign Material ..................................................... 423
    A. Foreign Law Translations ..................................... 423
    B. Periodical Indexes ............................................. 424
IV. Internet Resources .................................................. 426
    A. General Law Web Sites with Foreign and International
       Links .................................................................. 427
    B. Country Information Web Sites ............................... 428
    C. Foreign and International Legal Materials Web Sites... 428
V. The United Nations ..................................................... 430
    A. The International Court of Justice ......................... 430
    B. U.N. Documents .................................................. 431
       1. Readex—U.N. Index .......................................... 432
       2. UNDOC: Current Index ....................................... 432
       3. RLIN ............................................................ 432
       4. UNBIS Plus .................................................... 433

* Faculty Services Librarian, University of California-Los Angeles School of Law, Hugh and Hazel Darling Law Library. M.L.S., University of California-Los Angeles; J.D., University of San Francisco; B.A., Shimer College.

I wish to thank Eric B. Fastiff, Editor-in-Chief of the Cornell International Law Journal, for asking me to do this article; I would not have thought of doing it otherwise. I thank Nazareth Pantaloni for reading, editing, and commenting on each draft, and Myra Saunders and Linda Maisner for their assistance in editing. Wiltrud Harms provided invaluable help on the United Nations section, and I am very grateful. I also thank my husband Joseph and my daughter Siobhan for their support. There are many people who know far more than I do about foreign and international research, and I apologize for any mistakes or omissions. I thank them for the hours they have spent lecturing and writing about these topics. Perhaps if more librarians were asked to write these types of articles, the world of legal research would be a richer place.

As this is a Research Essay and its purpose is to provide information about how to conduct legal research, many of the citations, both in the footnotes and in the text, do not follow Bluebook style. Rather, in order to make the information as accessible as possible, citations contain fuller bibliographic information.

5. U.N. Web and Gopher Sites ........................................ 433
6. PeaceNet .................................................................. 434
C. United Nations Treaty Series ................................... 434
D. General Sources .................................................. 435

VI. The European Union ........................................... 436
A. General Information ............................................ 436
B. The European Court of Justice ................................ 437
C. EC Legislation .................................................... 438
1. The Official Journal ............................................. 438
2. Other Documents .................................................. 440
3. European Union Web Sites .................................... 440
4. Deciphering Citations ............................................ 440
5. Information Centers .............................................. 442

VII. The General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade/World Trade Organization ............................................. 442
A. Print Sources ....................................................... 442
B. Online and Web Sources ....................................... 443
C. Microfiche Sources ............................................... 443

VIII. Unification of Laws ............................................. 443
A. The Hague Conference on Private International Law ... 443
B. The International Institute for the Unification of Private Law ......................................................... 444
C. The United Nations Commission on International Trade Law ....................................................... 444
D. The Organization of American States ....................... 445
E. Non-Governmental Organizations ................................ 446

IX. Treaties ............................................................ 446
A. Primary Treaty Collections: Current ....................... 446
B. Historical Collections ............................................ 447
C. Collections of Other Countries ............................... 448
D. Main Treaty Indexes ............................................. 448
E. Finding Treaties by Subject ..................................... 449
F. Updating Treaties .................................................. 450

Conclusion ............................................................. 451

I. Basic Principles and Sources
There is now greater interest in foreign and international legal issues. While once the exclusive concern of specialists, the general legal researcher and librarian can no longer avoid dealing with foreign and international documents. This essay contains practical tips, sources, and tricks for researching international and foreign legal topics. The discussions on locating documents online include sources available on the Internet as well as through Lexis and Westlaw.

Many law schools now publish international law reviews, introducing law students to non-American research early in their careers. As most law students are barely familiar with U.S. legal research at the end of their first year, it is not surprising when, given citations to both basic and esoteric
documents cited by authors of articles on international topics, the students have no idea where to find documents for source collection and citation verification. Many authors of law review articles are experts in their fields and are present at the meetings where unpublished documents are distributed and discussed. Although these documents may not be distributed and published formally, authors often cite the unpublished draft documents in the interim. Students are also required to write publishable notes on topics appropriate for the journal; most librarians, but few students, know that the ability to write a note depends heavily on whether there are secondary sources on a topic, on whether there are relevant published documents, and on the law library's ability to obtain such sources.

Practicing lawyers often have difficulty locating current legal codes from municipalities and other jurisdictions, both in their own locales and in other states. Imagine the difficulties faced by U.S. lawyers representing domestic companies expanding their foreign markets. To conduct business in other countries, they must find relevant treaties and these countries' applicable national and local laws. This requires not only an understanding of international and foreign law, but also the ability to find and update the law. Unfortunately, most lawyers do not even know what questions to ask because they are working with a set of legal assumptions that they presume are universal.

Fundamental differences in approach and philosophy exist between civil law and common law jurisdictions. For example, in many civil jurisdictions there is no principle of stare decisis. The law flows primarily from civil codes rather than from case law. Consequently, respected commentaries and doctrinal writings about the codes may be given more weight by practitioners and judges than are cases, even if on point. In these jurisdictions, less weight is given to the factual circumstances of the parties and more to the spirit and principles of applicable laws. More subtle distinctions exist in the traditions, social practices, and roles of attorneys or legal advisers in other countries. While it is common for a law firm whose client is doing business internationally to engage local counsel in foreign countries, it is still necessary to understand the issues and laws involved, and to review the documentation of laws upon which its client relies.

Most transnational legal transactions boil down to a choice of law and forum: which country's legal system and laws will be used to settle legal disputes. A lawyer familiar only with the U.S. legal system may blindly argue for the application of U.S. law. This is shortsighted. Another country's laws and forum might well be more advantageous to the client's interests and legal situation. It is always worth at least a cursory look at the laws of a country to see whether they protect a client's interests before arguing that those laws should not apply.

American legal researchers are often surprised to find that codes, published at the federal and state level, annotated and regularly updated, do not exist in many other countries. Another country may have a code, but it may have been published seventy years ago, with every statute passed since then appearing in an unindexed gazette. Once I had to find the service of process laws for a Caribbean country. Its laws were a sheaf of papers tied together. Only after I worked my way backwards through the sheaf, turning pages with a moistened finger, did I discover the warning on the first page: "This paper has been treated with insecticide." But this sheaf was indeed that country's published current laws.

An exciting development in recent years is the involvement of both U.S. lawyers and law professors in helping to create legal systems for emerging democracies. In 1994, Professor Robert S. Summers and Cornell Law School hosted a group of Russian scholars, law professors, and lawyers to assist them in drafting a Russian commercial code. The American Bar Association Section on International Law helps developing countries and new democracies establish codes and legal systems; the ABA Cambodia Project, for example, is helping set up securities and bankruptcy systems in that country. The changes in the legal systems of Eastern European countries are enormous, and other developing countries, such as Vietnam, have also requested help. The ABA International Law section has 16,000 members, many of whom are interested in these issues and able to make significant contributions. All of these ventures require some understanding of foreign and international legal research.

My knowledge regarding international and foreign research stems from my work as a reference librarian at the Cornell University and U.C.L.A. Law Libraries. I have handled inquiries from professors, lawyers and students (particularly students collecting sources for the Cornell International Law Journal) and attended the American Association of Law Libraries Institutes designed to educate a new generation of foreign and international librarians. Since 1990, I have handled an increasing number of questions from law firms involved in legal proceedings and business deals of a transnational character. This essay, then, addresses those areas of international and foreign law often asked about at academic law library reference desks, and thus may be useful to similarly situated librarians, students, and practitioners. It is directed to the novice researcher.

II. Background Resources

One can find basic tools for international legal research in most large academic law libraries, in the larger county law libraries (most notably Los Angeles County Law Library), in law firms with transnational practices, and in a few court and bar association libraries. Legal researchers initially need introductions to the legal systems and legal bibliographies of the jurisdictions they are researching. This introductory information is found

---

in encyclopedias, legal research guides, bibliographies, and occasional articles. Two sources have been invaluable in my search for legal documents of foreign and international entities:


These two reference works provide practical information that leads to specific documents. Reynolds and Flores include a rich essay on each country's legal system and list titles of codes and case reporters. Germain's shorter treatise focuses on items of particular use to lawyers and provides both jurisdictional and substantive access points. If I could recommend only two titles for a small foreign and international reference collection, it would be these.

*The Guide to International Legal Research*\(^3\) is an extremely helpful book, worth reading thoroughly if your specialty is international legal research. There is a lot of practical information in this book and the bibliographic information is thorough. The introductory chapter, *Research Tips in International Law* by John W. Williams, presents a good overview of research techniques, tools, and processes.

Other reputable and extremely useful sources for gaining an understanding of a country's legal system are:


While there is no substitute for consulting these excellent introductions to legal systems, Lexis, Westlaw, and the Internet increasingly provide many shortcuts and connections to actual documents. Most practitioners, scholars, and students reading this article are familiar with Lexis and Westlaw, but they may not have used the Internet to find legal sources. If you are interested in international and foreign law, or in online access to U.S. government and court decisions without paying for Lexis and Westlaw, I strongly recommend learning how to access Internet resources.

Foreign and international transactions also create a great need for bilingual dictionaries. Some experts prefer a good general, rather than legal, English/foreign language dictionary. An accurate translation of a legal term explains the word in the context of a legal system. Imagine a Spanish/English legal dictionary giving the contextual meaning of a term

---

for all Spanish-speaking jurisdictions. False cognates abound, and the legal researcher must be cautiously aware.

Dictionaries of international terms are also useful. I recommend the following titles:

James R. Fox, *Dictionary of International and Comparative Law* (New York: Oceana Publications, 1992). This is the briefest and most concise of the international law dictionaries, and it often gives citations to treaties, cases, and other documents.

Clive Parry et al., *Encyclopedic Dictionary of International Law* (New York: Oceana Publications, 1986). This combines the features of a dictionary and an encyclopedia, with high-quality scholarly analysis and source references.

Robert L. Bledsoe & Boleslaw A. Boczek, *The International Law Dictionary* (Santa Barbara, CA: ABC-CLIO, 1987). The authors provide useful analysis, but the organization can be a barrier when one is in a rush.

Edward G. Hinkelman, *Dictionary of International Trade* (San Rafael, CA: World Trade Press, 1994). This is a good and inexpensive dictionary focused on trade. It includes extras like maps and addresses, phone numbers for organizations, and references to other useful materials.

Search tools and document collections exist in print, online, on CD-ROM, and in dreaded microfiche (though a handy collection in fiche will save you hours compared to finding individual documents). Lexis and Westlaw provide decisions from an increasing number of foreign jurisdictions. A full-text collection of treaties is also available on Lexis, although not through the academic law library subscription. The Internet has become a major resource of internationally significant documents, particularly U.N. documents. Some understanding of citation schemes will aid in finding particular documents and examples of citations are provided later in this essay.

Defining the updating process and verifying the authority of a particular foreign law, treaty, or case are especially difficult aspects of foreign and international law research. For good, basic, and quick identification and location of documents and updating processes, the best source is Germain’s Transnational Law Research, which is arranged in a manner which reflects the structured approach of a European mind. For those of us with chaotic American minds and eyes, the journey from the index to the book page can be harrowing. But once you open to the relevant section, the practical advice and sources are there. Professor Germain is an enthusiastic Internet user and future supplements to her work will include Internet sources.

Foreign jurisdictions have no Shepard’s citators or, in most cases, annotated codes, but U.S. lawyers expect to find them in translation. They

---

will not. U.S. lawyers also expect to find all foreign cases online. Cases are increasingly available online, but they are in the vernacular, and coverage is far from comprehensive. The usefulness of Lexis and Westlaw customer service is limited regarding their foreign and international databases. They are unlikely to have foreign language skills, and they tend not to know an ECJ from an ICJ decision. Use what online sources are available for convenience, but do not confuse an online search with thorough research.

III. Foreign Material

A. Foreign Law Translations

Reynolds and Flores, as well as Germain, identify official and unofficial translations of foreign laws; Germain’s volume includes a breakdown by subject as well as by jurisdiction. Amber Lee Smith, Foreign and International Librarian at the Los Angeles County Law Library, published a chapter entitled Foreign Law in Translation: Problems and Sources, in Introduction to Foreign Legal Systems, which includes over fifty pages of translation sources by type of publication and jurisdiction. The Internet also offers an interesting array of foreign laws. However, the laws are not always translated into English.

Lexis has French laws in French and Mexican laws in Spanish, but no other foreign language legal materials. Lexis has a collection of environmental legislation in translation from France, Italy, Brazil, Mexico, Spain, Indonesia, and the European Union. The translated laws of China are on Lexis, as are legal texts from Russia and other Eastern European countries. Lexis has foreign language news in Dutch, French, German, and Italian.

Book sets containing English language translations (some verbatim, some digested) include:

Commercial Laws of Europe (London: European Law Centre/Sweet and Maxwell, 1978-).


6. For French laws, see LEXIS, Loireg Library. For Mexican laws, see LEXIS, Mexico Library.

7. See LEXIS, Envirn Library, Intehs File.

8. See LEXIS, Intlaw Library, Chinal File.


10. For Eastern European legal texts, see LEXIS, Intlaw Library, Eeleg File.

11. See LEXIS, World Library, in combined and individual language files.

Doing Business in Europe (Chicago: CCH International, 1972-).

Martindale-Hubbell Law Directory (Summit, NY: Reed, 1990-).

Lexis now has case law from Australia, Canada, England, the European Union, France, Ireland, New Zealand, Northern Ireland, and Scotland. Sometimes foreign legislation and case law appear as part of a news story, though more often in summary than in full text. For example, once a BBC transcript gave me a needed Ethiopian law. More often, though, you obtain information which will help in tracking down the law in print.

Sometimes periodical articles include translations of foreign documents. For a thorough list of periodicals which, at times, publish such translations, see Amber Lee Smith’s chapter, Foreign Law in Translation: Problems and Sources.12

An attorney can easily get into trouble by using translations. Finding a translator who is adept at the language and who understands the legal meaning and context of the words is essential but not always possible. Finding a lawyer who knows the language and the legal system may be the best solution. Given these problems, eventually a lawyer will have to look at the laws of a country in the vernacular in order to rely on them.13

There are a number of services which provide translations on demand. A recent article by Barbara Silbersack in Legal Information Alert lists these companies and generally describes their services and prices.14 Geolex, ASET International Services, and Foreign Tax Law Publishers have inventories of translated laws for sale.15

Publisher catalogs are very good sources for locating translations of foreign laws and practitioner-oriented materials. Major publishers of international and foreign books and journals include Oceana, Nijhoff, Transnational-Juris, Sweet and Maxwell, and Kluwer.16 Attorneys and librarians are well advised to get on the mailing lists of these publishers in order to stay informed of current materials.

B. Periodical Indexes

A time-tested back-door approach to identifying primary law is finding secondary sources in which it is cited. To find U.S. and Commonwealth periodical articles, U.S. researchers rely on Current Law Index and Index to Legal Periodicals & Books in their various electronic and print formats. To find

---

12. Smith, supra note 5.
13. Lawyers should use official translations whenever possible.
15. Geolex (now a part of National Insurance Law Service (NILS)): (800) 446-0906; ASET International Services Corp.: (800) 787-8726; Foreign Tax Law Publishers, Inc.: (904) 253-5785.
16. For a list of the addresses and phone numbers of these and many other publishers, see CLAIRE GERMAIN, GERMAIN’S TRANSNATIONAL LAW RESEARCH, app. 1 (1991).
international and foreign periodical articles, the following indexes are useful:

*Index to Foreign Legal Periodicals (IFLP)*, Thomas H. Reynolds ed. (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, published four times a year, with 1960-in print, from 1986- online through RLIN, from 1984- online through Westlaw, and on CD-ROM through SilverPlatter).

This is the first index most U.S. researchers should consult for articles, essays, and Festschriften on international, comparative, and municipal laws of non-U.S. and non-Commonwealth origin. *IFLP* was the first legal index to be “multi-lingual in coverage as well as multi-disciplinary in scope.” Until about 1950, foreign and international law articles were generally not indexed in the United States. The subject arrangement is familiar to most researchers; a companion outline is less familiar to U.S. researchers but perhaps easier for Europeans. English subject headings are translated into Spanish, French, and German. Titles are published in the vernacular with explanatory notes when necessary, and all alphabets are Romanized.

Online access to *IFLP* from 1986 to the present is available on RLIN, where one can search for specific words used in subject headings and titles. SilverPlatter has also recently released a CD-ROM version of RLIN.

*Public International Law: A Current Bibliography of Books and Articles* (Heidelberg: Springer, 1975-).

Compiled by the staff of the Max Planck Institute and published twice annually, this bibliography evaluates over 1000 journals to provide a “comprehensive bibliography of the entire current literature in its field.” The bibliography of current books comes from the Institute’s acquisitions lists and therefore reflects their holdings. The scope notes are excellent. Private international law is specifically excluded, but the editors take a broad view of public international law. Titles are in the vernacular, with occasional English descriptions appended for clarity. The classification scheme is useful and printed in English, French, German, and Spanish. Topics include geographical and political entities and international organizations, including the United Nations, European Union, and a section on non-governmental organizations. Articles are classified under all applicable headings, and cross-references are thoughtfully listed for each entry. There are also subject and person indexes. Published twice a year, this index helps the researcher review literature in the field.

---


18. For a description of RLIN, see *infra* part V.B.3.

PAIS International (New York: Public Affairs Information Service, 1991-) (published monthly, and every fourth issue is cumulative).20

Founded in 1914 by a group of librarians, Public Affairs Information Service (PAIS) is based at the New York Public Library. PAIS International indexes worldwide public policy literature in English, French, German, Italian, Portuguese, and Spanish. The subject headings and abstract notes are in English, and periodical articles from about 1600 journals are indexed. PAIS also indexes about 7000-8000 books a year as well as documents and reports from government and international organizations.

The PAIS index is extremely useful for researching a wide range of public policy and social issues. The concepts cross traditional disciplinary boundaries. In addition to law, business, finance, education, and social work, PAIS indexes academic social science areas such as economics, political science, public administration, international law, the environment, and demography. Reports and commentary from the general press are also indexed when pertinent. Online coverage begins in 1972, under the title PAIS Bulletin.

European Legal Journals Index (Hebden Bridge, West Yorkshire, England: Legal Information Resources, Ltd., 1993-) (published monthly, with quarterly and annual cumulations).

This new service indexes legal journals and newsletters published in Europe in English. It has useful case and legislation indexing, including legislation from the United Kingdom, the European Union, and other international and foreign bodies. The English language restriction means that most of the journals are published in England (with a few published by Kluwer in the Netherlands). For those researchers who can read only in English, this may be the index of least frustration.

IV. Internet Resources

The Internet provides some useful law-devoted sites which offer useful information to foreign and international researchers. Subscribing to legal listservs is a great way to learn of new sites. The sites listed in this section will routinely provide links to new sites as well. Today, Internet providers of legal information are careful about putting dates on their documents, and most provide the e-mail address of a contact person. This generally provides enough information to make a reliability check and report errors. Having seen so many errors in print, I am less squeamish than some about the reliability of Internet sources.

It is beyond the scope of this essay to provide a meaningful introduction to Internet researching and functions. Any bookstore will have a

20. Available in print, online, and on CD-ROM. The international edition was created in 1991 by combining the PAIS Bulletin and PAIS Foreign Language Index. The Bulletin service began in 1915.
number of how-to books on using the Internet.\textsuperscript{21}

In this section, I list and describe Internet law sites of value to foreign and international law researchers, and provide Uniform Resource Locators (URLs) for each site.\textsuperscript{22} I have tested each of these URLs, but the Internet being what it is, these URLs could change tomorrow. I strongly recommend learning where several, well-organized law sites are and visiting them regularly. They will provide up-to-date links to other law sites.

Be aware that parts of the URL are case sensitive; that is, it matters whether the URL has upper and lower case letters. A misplaced slash, dot, or capital letter prevents an URL from working. My preferred method of entering addresses is to copy the address and paste the address into the place where I enter such addresses in my software. Bookmarking your favorite sites is the best approach.

A. General Law Web Sites with Foreign and International Links

The Legal Information Institute (LII) at Cornell Law School is responsible for much of the development of law on the Web and in WWW technology. The LII is a reliable publisher of U.S. legal texts and documents. LII offers links to many sites which offer foreign and international legal texts and quickly announces new Internet offerings related to law. The LII URL is:

\texttt{http://www.law.cornell.edu}

The University of Chicago D'Angelo Law Library's site provides nicely organized links to foreign and international sites, including links to embassies, country reports, and foreign language reference materials:

\texttt{http://www-law.lib.uchicago.edu/lib/intl.html}

The University of Indiana School of Law's site functions as a WWW index to other law sites:

\texttt{http://www.law.indiana.edu}

The University of Southern California Law Center provides links to foreign and international law collections on the Web:

\texttt{http://www.usc.edu/dept/law-lib/index.html}

The Washburn School of Law has a foreign and international law collection on the Web:

\texttt{http://lawlib.wuacc.edu/forint/forintmain.html}

\textsuperscript{21} For a review of Internet books, some of which are geared to law users, see Kathie J. Sullivan, \textit{A Comparative Review of Internet Books}, \textit{86 Law Lib. J.} 219, 221-24 (1994). Some of the information in these books is outdated, but much of it is still useful, and some of the sources may have later editions.

\textsuperscript{22} URLs can be thought of as phone numbers or addresses, which are entered in the client software. Most Internet sites offer a variety of ways to access information, such as telnet, gopher, and WWW. Web URLs begin with the letters "http" (hypertext transfer protocol), and gopher URLs begin with "gopher."
B. Country Information Web Sites

As of November 1995, legal materials from the following countries were available on the Internet:

Australia
   http://austlii.law.uts.edu.au/ (legislation and cases)

Canada
   http://www.droit.umontreal.ca/CSC.html (Supreme Court cases from 1993, keyword searchable)
   http://info.ic.gc.ca/opengov (government materials)
   http://canada.justice.gc.ca/index_en.html (Department of Justice, including legislation)

Germany (in German):
   http://www.jura.uni-sb.de

Italy (in Italian):
   gopher://risc.idg.fi.cnr.it:70

Japan (constitution in English and Japanese; copyright law in Japanese):
   http://fuji.stanford.edu/GUIDE/japan_legal_info_text.html

Mexico
   gopher://naserv.gdl.iteso.mx:70/11/Informacion%20Academica/
   Derecho (codes and other laws in Spanish)
   http://info.juridicas.unam.mx/ (commentary and federal laws in Spanish)

Peru (including constitutions of the world in Spanish):
   gopher://ulima.edu.pe/70/11/ccpp/seccion1/cextr

South Africa
   http://pc72.law.wits.ac.za/ (Constitutional Court opinions)

This country list is not exhaustive, and many of the other sites listed track and link to other foreign law sites. The European Law Students Association Jurweb site organizes links by country and continent; not all are in English, but the list appears to be comprehensive and will include many resources not listed above:

   http://www.uni-bayreuth.de/students/elsa/jura/geo/jurweb-geo-home.html

C. Foreign and International Legal Materials Web Sites

Collections of foreign legal materials, including treaties and constitutions (but not texts of foreign cases and statutes) are located at the following sites:

   Multilateral Conventions (The Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy):
      http://www.tufts.edu/fletcher/multilaterals.html
International Constitutions Collection (in English, and includes many facts about the countries, areas of interest, and lists of treaties):

http://www.econ.uni-hamburg.de/law/

Wiretap Spies World Constitution collection:

gopher://wiretap.spies.com:70/11/Gov/World

The House of Representatives Home Page Internet Law Library has Laws of Other Nations, but has relatively few actual laws:

http://www.pls.com:8001/his/52.htm

Several sites focus on specific international law topics. Project DIANA, named in memory of the late Yale Law Librarian Diana Vincent-Daviss, encompasses a growing human rights library on the Internet. This consortium, which includes the law schools at Yale, the University of Minnesota, and the University of Cincinnati, has begun mounting a collection of treaties and other documents, including legal briefs submitted to and decisions of human rights courts; the collection will include status information. DIANA will also include treatises, bibliographies, and other secondary materials. This project is one of a number of thoughtful new WWW ventures which shine because of the substantive knowledge put into their creation and maintenance:

http://elsinore.cis.yale.edu/dianaweb/sites.htm
http://www.law.uc.edu/Diana/

In cooperation with the DIANA consortium, the University of Minnesota recently mounted an extremely well done human rights library, which includes treaties with authoritative citations, the Bibliography for Research on International Human Rights Law, and other documents, at:

http://www.umn.edu/humanrts

The top-notch International Trade Law Home Page publishes trade related treaties, conventions, and model laws and rules, including texts of reservations:

http://ananse.irv.uit.no/trade_law/nav/trade.html

The WWW Virtual Library: Law: International & Environmental Law, a subsection of the Indiana University site, has many links to other URLs with environmental laws, treaties, journals, and services:

http://www.law.indiana.edu/law/intenvlaw.html

The Socioeconomic Data and Applications Center's (SEDAC), under the auspices of the Consortium for International Earth Science Information Network, is mounting a collection of broadly defined policy instru-

ments, including "legal documents such as treaties, agreements, and laws; information on the negotiation, structure, and status of these legal instruments; and directives, initiatives, and statements from government agencies and non-governmental organizations. This prototype version of the Policy Instruments Database is focused on international environmental agreements:


International organizations often publish international documents and foreign legislation in translation. The following identifies some organizations which issue documents of interest to legal researchers and provide tips on finding the documents and understanding the organizations.

In my experience, the following bodies publish international documents most commonly needed for legal research: the United Nations, the European Union, the GATT/World Trade Organization, and the Hague Conference on Private International Law. International environment, human rights, and trade are the most commonly requested treaty subjects. The remainder of this article discusses how to recognize and find these documents.

V. The United Nations

A. The International Court of Justice

Because U.S. researchers rely heavily on case law, this section first describes how to find International Court of Justice (ICJ) cases. This U.N. organ has fifteen judges elected by the General Assembly and Security Council, and the official reports are contained in:

Reports of Judgments, Advisory Opinions and Orders (The Hague: ICJ, 1947-) (first issued as pamphlets and then bound volumes). The decisions are issued in both French and English. There is a yearly index for most years. Citations look like this: 1993 I.C.J. 1 (volume numbers are used only when a judgment continues in several bound volumes).

Other sources of information include:

Pleadings, Oral Arguments and Documents (The Hague: ICJ, 1949-). The oral arguments are verbatim.

Communiqué (The Hague: ICJ). These are press releases available at no


25. Paul Zarins' handout, Using United Nations Documents to Find Treaties, Resolutions and Decisional Material, was extremely helpful in preparing this section. Mr. Zarins distributed this document at the American Association of Law Libraries 1993 Summer Institute (entitled Introduction to International Organizations), held July 6-9, 1993, at Harvard Law School. A book issued as an extension of this institute, entitled Introduction to International Organizations, is due to be published by Oceana later in 1996, and will contain this handout.
charge from the ICJ Registry. They include announcements of new cases, information about proceedings, and summaries of judgments, opinions, and orders, as well as summaries of dissenting opinions.

*Hague Yearbook of International Law* (The Hague: ICJ, 1947-). The Yearbook covers publications of the Court and has a chronological list of official citations to opinions and pleadings. It also includes ICJ procedures, judges' biographies, and a review of pending cases.

Westlaw provides full-text ICJ judgments, opinions and orders in English from 1947 to the present in the INT-ICJ database. Lexis has an ICJ case file which is limited to cases which also appear in *International Legal Materials (ILM)*.

**B. U.N. Documents**

The United Nations is a very complex organization, with most of its work done through subsidiary bodies. The documentation system is vast and well-organized, but access requires a basic knowledge of U.N. structure. Also, many meeting and conference documents discussed and cited in the literature are not part of its depository or dissemination scheme.

U.N. documents are generally retrieved by document number from collections held by large academic libraries and U.N. depository libraries. The organs of the United Nations are identified with document symbols. The principal organs (and the initial letters of their identifying document symbols) are:

- A/- General Assembly
- E/- Economic and Social Council
- S/- Security Council
- ST/- Secretariat
- T/- Trusteeship Council

There are other symbols for which the initial elements are acronyms, especially among the human rights treaty bodies. For example:

- CCPR/- Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Human Rights Committee

A document symbol also contains numbers or letters which denote the nature of the document, further subdivisions in the subsidiary body's structure, or the nature of the document's text. An experienced researcher can interpret the U.N. document symbols to gain clues about the document, and books such as the *Guide to International Legal Research* and *United Nations Documentation: A Brief Guide* also help.

Here are some examples of U.N. documents:

---


27. GUIDE, supra note 3.

A/RES/49/1 (the first General Assembly Resolution from the 49th session)


E/1982/SR.1-29 (an Economic and Social Council summary record of plenary meetings held in 1982)

1. Readex—U.N. Index

Readex, among other things, reproduces U.N. documents on microfiche. Many academic libraries hold the Readex U.N. collections. An extremely useful companion to this set—that stands alone as a great tool for identifying documentation—is the Readex Index to United Nations Documents and Publications on CD-ROM. It provides comprehensive indexing from 1983 to the present and covers some materials from 1979-83. The Readex U.N. CD-ROM also contains the full-text of General Assembly (1982-), Security Council (1974-), and Economic and Social Council (1982-) resolutions and decisions. Readex will eventually index documents dating from the inception of the United Nations. It has one of the best user interfaces available on a CD-ROM product. Unfortunately, like many CD-ROM products, it does not handle complex search statements well. One or two words per search works best, with restrictions added through the menu option.

Many academic law libraries also hold a smaller subset of the Readex microfiche collections, called the Basic Law Library Collection, which contains documents from U.N. bodies most heavily used by law researchers.

2. UNDOC: Current Index

The most comprehensive and key bibliographic tool published by the United Nations is UNDOC: Current Index (previously called UNDEX and United Nations Documents Index). This print index is, by most accounts, difficult to use, but some document mavens swear by it. Every issue of UNDOC has a page called “Documents Series Symbols” (in the User’s Guide section) that can help with symbol interpretation.

3. RLIN

Online access to bibliographic information about U.N. documents and books, as well as articles on U.N. topics, is available through RLIN, which is accessible at many academic and other large research libraries (often through the public interface called Eureka). Several times I have suc-
cessfully identified documents on RLIN which I could not find using the Readex CD-ROM or UNDOC, and, once identified, obtained the documents easily from documents collections. Effective searching of this database requires a few tips.

The UN DOCFILE in RLIN is the UNDOC: Current Index discussed in the previous paragraph, which indexes documents back to 1979. RLIN also contains the UN CATFILE, which includes citations to non-U.N. materials indexed by the United Nations, such as books and journal articles. Limiting the library (or location, in Eureka) to NYDW searches the CATFILE; limiting to NYDR searches the DOCFILE.

The most productive indexes to use for U.N. materials are Subject Word, Subject Phrase, or Corporate Phrase (Eureka does not tell you about the Corporate Phrase index but it does work). When searching the Corporate Phrase index, always precede the search terms with the prefix “UN”.

Searching by document number alone is not possible, although the 086 field of the record does have the U.N. document number. Once search results are obtained, an ALS search in RLIN can include part of the document number. Unfortunately, ALS is among the many fine search features of RLIN which is not available in the Eureka interface.

4. **UNBIS Plus**

*UNBIS Plus* is a new publication on CD-ROM created by Chadwyck-Healey, in collaboration with the Dag Hammarskjold Library. It is more comprehensive than either RLIN or Readex, and the interface is reasonably easy to use. *UNBIS Plus* includes not only the cataloged documents which appear on RLIN, but also bibliographic citations to the holdings of the Dag Hammarskjold Library and to speeches made in the major U.N. bodies. It includes the full text of resolutions adopted by major bodies, voting information, agenda item numbers and titles from meetings, and reference files which detail the U.N. document series. Coverage of bibliographic information begins in 1975 on the backfiles disks. Initial release of the interface is in English, but French and Spanish versions are planned. Research libraries with U.N. collections are excited about this new product.

5. **U.N. Web and Gopher Sites**

For current and historical documents, the U.N. Development Programme and Department of Public Information gopher and Web sites provide fast, reliable, and free documentation distribution. They are located at:

- gopher://gopher.undp.org
- http://www.undp.org

30. For example: fin sp child refugees and cp un economic and social#
31. For example: fin sp whaling/als 086 td
These sites contain large amounts of information and are well-structured (though there are some logical inconsistencies) because the hierarchical organization of the United Nations lends itself to the hierarchical gopher display format. Located at these sites are General Assembly resolutions going back to the early 1980s, Security Council resolutions back to 1974, and an increasing number of selected documents, such as speeches, press releases, and conference information. Additionally, an unofficial but comprehensive U.N. site is at:

http://www.undcp.org/unlinks.html

For a complete list of links to Internet sites containing U.N. information, go to the University of Minnesota Human Rights Library. The direct URL for the U.N. link is:

http://www.umn.edu/humanrts/links/unlinks.htm

6. PeaceNet

For some documents outside the U.N. documentation structure, it may be necessary to utilize a paid online service. PeaceNet is a service which offers, among many other things, fast and reliable access to U.N. speeches contained in press releases, letters of the Secretary-General, and conference information (even as the conferences are in progress) through its news services and databases. This information was, in the recent past, difficult to find. So much is now available through Internet sites, however, that both ephemeral and formal documents are more readily accessible. PeaceNet offers individual and library subscriptions, and it is a way to gain Internet access. It is used by many non-governmental organizations and activists as a discussion medium and the electronic bulletin boards may provide an interactive approach to finding people with information.32

C. United Nations Treaty Series

The United Nations Treaty Series (UNTS)33 is not part of the U.N. documents collection; it is a completely separate entity. Treaties deposited with the Secretary General are collected in this series and have the series abbreviation U.N.T.S. The UNTS is held in print or microfiche by most large academic law libraries. There is an index to UNTS which is not timely, but it is the only source which indexes U.N. bilateral treaties. The United Nations also publishes Statement of Treaties and International Agreements Regis-

32. PeaceNet subscriptions are arranged through the Institute for Global Communications, 18 De Boom Street, San Francisco, California 94107. Telephone: (415) 442-0220; fax: (415) 546-1794; telex: 404205417CDP; e-mail: peacenet@igc.apc.org. PeaceNet also has a gopher site at: gopher.igc.apc.org/70/11/peace and a web site at: http://www.peacenet.apc.org/peacenet/

They do not give away for free on these Internet sites all that is provided through the PeaceNet paid service.

tered or Filed and Recorded with the Secretariat.\textsuperscript{34} This comes out monthly and gives a list of registrations; while the \textit{UNTS} number is often lacking, at least one knows that the treaty was registered. It is important to note that \textit{UNTS} publishes treaties by year of registration, which is often later than the dates upon which they were signed or came into force. In addition to \textit{UNTS}, many treaties deposited with the Secretary General are in other treaty collections.

An essential tool for verifying the status of multilateral treaties is the annual \textit{Multilateral Treaties Deposited with the Secretary-General}.\textsuperscript{35} Part I covers U.N. multilateral treaties, and it is arranged by chapters on topics such as human rights, commercial arbitration, and law of the sea. Within each chapter the arrangement is chronological. Part II covers League of Nations multilateral treaties in chronological order. An extremely useful feature is the reprint of individual country treaty reservations and declarations. \textit{Multilateral Treaties} is available on the Internet at the U.N. Treaty Data Base:

\url{http://www.un.org/Depts/Treaty/}

After checking \textit{Multilateral Treaties Deposited with the Secretary-General}, updated information may be obtained from the Treaties Section, Office of Legal Affairs, United Nations Secretariat. They will provide a status report for treaties registered with the United Nations.\textsuperscript{36}

D. General Sources

General sources of U.N. information are not covered in this essay, but many U.N. publications give clues which may lead to desired documents. Some of the more useful sources include: \textit{United Nations Handbook},\textsuperscript{37} \textit{Yearbook of the U.N.},\textsuperscript{38} \textit{U.N. Chronicle},\textsuperscript{39} \textit{Diplomatic World Bulletin and Delegates World Bulletin},\textsuperscript{40} and \textit{Journal of the United Nations}.\textsuperscript{41} Standard reference

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{34} \textit{STATEMENT OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL AGREEMENTS REGISTERED OR FILED AND RECORDED WITH THE SECRETARIAT} (New York: United Nations, 1946/47-).
\item \textsuperscript{35} \textit{MULTILATERAL TREATIES DEPOSITED WITH THE SECRETARY-GENERAL} (New York: United Nations, 1981-) (Annual) (published from 1967-1979 as \textit{MULTILATERAL TREATIES IN RESPECT OF WHICH THE SECRETARY-GENERAL PERFORMS DEPOSITORY FUNCTIONS}).
\item \textsuperscript{36} If the Secretary General acts as the depository, telephone (212) 963-7958 or 963-5484. If the Secretary General is not the depository, call the U.N. Treaty Information System at (212) 963-2523. The telephone number of the Office of the Chief of the Treaty Section is (212) 963-5048; they can help with legal questions concerning treaties. The Legal Officer of Depository Functions, at (212) 963-5472, can also help with the legal aspects of treaties.
\item \textsuperscript{37} \textit{UNITED NATIONS HANDBOOK} (Wellington, N.Z.: Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 1981-).
\item \textsuperscript{39} \textit{U.N. CHRONICLE} (New York: United Nations, Office of Pub. Info., 1964-).
\item \textsuperscript{40} \textit{THE DIPLOMATIC WORLD BULLETIN AND DELEGATES WORLD BULLETIN} (New York: Diplomatic World Bulletin Publications, Inc., 1975-).
\item \textsuperscript{41} \textit{JOURNAL OF THE UNITED NATIONS} (New York: United Nations, Dep't of Conference Services, 1945-).
\end{itemize}
sources such as *The Europa World Yearbook* summarize the activities of international organizations and may also provide useful research clues.

VI. The European Union

A. General Information

International legal researchers often need information and documents regarding the European Community (EC) and the political framework called the European Union (EU). This supranational organization includes as Member States most of the industrialized West European countries. EU institutions include the European Court of Justice (which has jurisdiction over EC but not EU matters), the Council of Ministers of the European Union (the final decisionmaking institution), the European Commission (charged with implementing the treaties and proposing legislation), and the European Parliament. For more information on the EU/EC and its documentation, consult the appropriate sections in Germain or Reynolds and Flores. The following books also contain excellent explanations of the structure and functions of these institutions and the documentation produced by each (note that not all will reflect EU changes):


---

42. EUROPA WORLD YEARBOOK (London: Europa Publications Ltd., 1989-).


44. "Supranational organizations have the ability to take decisions which are directly binding upon member states, public and private enterprises, as well as individuals within these states, whereas traditional organizations can act or execute decisions only by or through member states." GIUSEPPE SCHIAVONE, *INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS: A DICTIONARY AND DIRECTORY* (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 3d ed. 1993).

45. Member states as of November 1995 were: Austria, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Ireland, Italy, Luxembourg, the Netherlands, Portugal, Spain, Sweden, and the United Kingdom.

46. On November 17, 1993, the EC Commission decided to use the name European Commission in all but legal and formal contexts, in which it is still called the Commission of the European Communities.

47. GERMAIN, supra note 16.


For researching EU/EC matters, it helps to know French. There are eleven official Community languages, but just about everything is published initially in French. For searching the most current sources and online full-text databases, French is the most useful language.

B. The European Court of Justice

Law researchers are often interested in the decisions of the European Court of Justice (ECJ). The ECJ has non-exclusive jurisdiction over EC matters. These cases appear in official and unofficial reporters and are available on Lexis (EURCOM library, CASES file) and Westlaw (CELEX-CS database). Coverage in English, however, is not comprehensive because of delays in translation.

The following reporters publish the texts of ECJ opinions:

*Reports of Cases Before the Court* (Luxembourg: EC, 1959-). This is the official reporter. The commonly used title is *European Court Reports* (*ECR*). All ECJ opinions are eventually published here. However, each opinion is released only after it is translated into all official languages. Delays of two to three years are the rule. For more current sources, see the other print sources or call the Information Center listed below; they often have slip opinions available in French. U.S. law libraries usually have the English edition of the *ECR*. Since 1990, this set included reports of the Court of First Instance, an inferior court that primarily adjudicates questions regarding EC internal affairs; those reports are now in a subset called *Reports of European Community Staff Cases* (*ECR-SC*, 1994-).

*Common Market Law Reports* (London: European Law Centre/Sweet & Maxwell Ltd., 1962-) (*CMLR*). This began appearing weekly in April 1978. It contains ECJ decisions, judgments of the courts of Member States, and some Commission decisions and legislative material. It also has a cumulative annual index.

*Common Market Reporter* (Chicago: Commerce Clearing House, 1962-). The *European Community Cases* volumes contain selected ECJ decisions and certain Commission decisions.


49. Courts of EC member states also interpret and apply Community law. The European Court of Justice does not have jurisdiction over the European Union, but only the EC, which includes the former EEC, European Coal and Steel Community (ECSC), and European Atomic Energy Community (EURATOM).
Proceedings of the Court of Justice of the European Communities (Luxembourg: Information Service of the Court of Justice of the European Communities). A weekly bulletin summarizing opinions and judgments, this is an excellent current awareness tool because of its detail, which is not easily available elsewhere, especially in English. Good for searching for very recent cases on a topic or tracking the ECJ. One can expect about a three-month delay. This publication has an annual index.

ECJ notices of judgments (not full text opinions) are published in the "C" section of the Official Journal, indexed by subject in the Official Journal Alphabetical Index, listed by case number in the Methodological Index, and accessible online through Westlaw (CELEX-CS database) and Lexis (INTLAW library, ECLAW file). A six month delay is standard.

The quickest access to ECJ opinions is often through Lexis in the French language libraries. As the court always issues opinions in French and in the language of the party country, there is always a French copy available.

C. EC Legislation

Finding EC legislation is important because the case law flows from EC treaties and secondary legislation. Legislation takes the form of regulations, directives, decisions, recommendations, and opinions. Harmonizing legislation, enacted by Member States to implement EC law at the national level, generally flows from an EC directive.

1. The Official Journal

Community legislation is published in the Official Journal, the official gazette of the European Community. It contains both proposed and final legislation. The Official Journal (OJ) is the authoritative source for the text of treaties. It is abbreviated in citations as O.J. (more common in the U.S.), J.O., and J.O.C.E. It is published daily and is divided into parts:

- **L Series** contains legislation, directives, and regulations adopted by the Commission and Council.
- **C Series** contains many types of communications, including reports of activities, proposals for new legislation, and notices of ECJ judgments (but not the full text of the opinions).
- **S Supplement** has notices of tender invitations for development contracts and other types of procurement and public works contracts.
- **Annex** contains the debates of the European Parliament.

**Special Edition.** The OJ was first published in 1958. When the United Kingdom joined the Community on January 1, 1973, a Special Edition of
the *Official Journal* was prepared because it was not previously published in English. *Special Edition* has English translations of all Community legislation still in force when the United Kingdom joined and covers the period from 1952-1972. Pagination corresponds to the original *Official Journal* but, because legislation no longer in force was omitted, gaps in pagination occur.

An edited version of the *Official Journal* is available on Westlaw in the CELEX file and on Lexis in the INTLAW library, ECLAW file. Coverage dates vary depending on the material. The entire unedited *Official Journal* is available on Lexis in the INTNAT library, JOCE file; coverage began in late 1952, and there is about a one-month delay for current issues.52

The looseleaf service most useful for simple tracking of EU legislation is:

*Common Market Reporter* (Chicago: Commerce Clearing House, 1962-). This looseleaf service contains texts of treaties, secondary legislation, pending legislation, drafts of proposals, and case law annotations. It has a good topical index and weekly newsletter, and includes the Community Cases volume mentioned above.

A valuable tool in tracking legislation both in and out of force is:

*European Communities Legislation: Current Status* (London: Butterworths, 1992-) (annual cumulative publication). The “How to Use” section is written in all Community languages. Access is both numerical and topical.

National legislation enacted in harmony with EC legislation can be difficult to track. Useful tools include:

*Butterworths EC Legislation Implementor* (London: Butterworths, 1992-). Though designed to track U.K. implementation of Community directives, it contains a report that summarizes Community-wide implementation. It is easy to use and indispensable.

*Bulletin of Legal Developments* (London: British Institute of International and Comparative Law, 1966-). This includes legal developments for all countries, with an emphasis on the U.K. and Europe.

*Commercial Laws of Europe* (London: European Law Centre, 1978-). The set includes texts of legislation in the original language and in English.

52. The CELEX database is one of the European Union Eurobases. It can be accessed directly from the Commission in Luxembourg, but most law searchers use it through their Lexis or Westlaw subscriptions. They both have a lag time of about six months. CELEX contains an edited version of the *Official Journal*. The SCAD database, another Eurobase, is a bibliographical database which is updated weekly. It tracks legislation and indexes publications from and about the EU. In addition to direct access from Luxembourg, SCAD is available on CD-ROM. Chadwyck-Healey produces the CD-ROM Eurocat, and Context Ltd. produces SCAD + CD.
2. Other Documents

Other documents associated with the legislative process include those from the European Commission, the European Parliament, the Economic and Social Committee, and the Council of Ministers. European Commission Documents (COM Docs) are the generic terms for working documents of the Commission associated with its role as initiator and implementer of EC legislation. Most final (not draft) COM Docs appear in the Official Journal C Series. Occasionally, the EU Information Center has documents that are not yet final which they lend to libraries upon request.

European Parliament debates are in the Annex to the OJ. Opinions are in the “C” section of the OJ. Parliament Reports are available on microfiche.53 The Week54 functions as an index to Parliament opinions and reports. Economic and Social Committee Opinions are in the Official Journal C Series and arranged by subject. Information Reports are available in microfiche, mimeograph, and occasionally in monograph form. Council of Ministers Common Positions appear in the C Series but texts do not; they must be obtained directly from the Council.

3. European Union Web Sites

Internet resources for the European Union are rapidly improving. Currently, the documents are not systematically placed on an Internet site. The main umbrella site is maintained by Europa, “a European Commission service offering user-friendly and interactive information on the European Union’s goals, institutions and policies.” It provides links to most other EU sites, and is located at:

http://www.cec.lu/Welcome.html

A subpart of this server is the Information Society Project, which presents significant EU documents at:


Another EU WWW server is “I’m Europe.” It includes documents and an engine to conduct full text searches of EC WWW servers:

http://www.echo.lu/

4. Deciphering Citations

Citation examples are helpful for novices. Bluebook (fifteenth edition) citation forms for EC materials are covered in Rule 20, “International Materials,” particularly in Rules 20.5.2 and 20.8.2. Table T.3, “Intergovernmental Organizations,” lists common abbreviations and parallel citation rules.

53. Reports (Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, 1984-).
Some of the research books listed above will help with deciphering citations. Also, remember to use abbreviation books and the Bluebook. Once the source is identified, the material itself may make the citation formula obvious. Here are some sample citations to EC materials:

Case Law:
This case appears in the European Court Reports, the official source, and in Common Market Law Reports, an unofficial reporter. Searching for the case number is the best way to find individual cases online.

Council regulations:
The issuing body is indicated parenthetically. The last two digits of the year the regulation was issued follow the slash.

Council directives:
The last two digits of the year of the directive precede the slash. Note that a proper Bluebook citation to an EC directive or regulation also contains an Of citation. It is omitted in these examples.

Official Journal citations:
1993 O.J. (L 200) 7
This is the correct Bluebook citation to the L Series of the 1993 Official Journal, Issue 200, page 7.

1988 O.J. C 274
This is an Official Journal citation given online. There is no page citation, just the year, series, and issue number. However, each issue begins with a good table of contents, so finding the page number is not difficult.

1971 J.O. (L 20) 8
Citation to the Journal Officiel des Communautés Europeennes. Before 1972, there was no English edition.

Special Edition citation:
1965-66 O.J. SPEC. Ed. 265

COM documents:
COM(87)100 final
This citation is the final, public version of a COM document (drafts are not made public). The two-digit parenthetical is the last two digits of the publication year, and “100,” which is the “running number,” has no particular significance other than to number the document. While draft COM docs are not available through public sources, they are widely circulated for review and comment and often cited.
5. Information Centers

There is one EU Information Center in the United States. The staff is knowledgeable and helpful. However, the center is understaffed and you will likely reach an answering machine. Calls are usually returned within a day.

VII. The General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade/World Trade Organization

A. Print Sources

The World Trade Organization (WTO), until recently known as the GATT (General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade), produces documents of significance to legal researchers. By far, the most popular legal documents are the GATT panel reports (also known as panel decisions, GATT cases, and GATT reports). GATT panel reports are ultimately published in Basic Instruments and Selected Documents (BISD). One WTO report has been issued to date, and de-restricted WTO panel reports will be published in BISD. BISD runs several years behind and not all reports are published. The index term in BISD for panel reports is “conciliation.” Because the index is cumulative, one need only look in the index to the latest volume. World Trade and Arbitration Materials has proved to be a reliable source of popular and recent panel reports. Some panel reports are published in International Legal Materials. A publication called Inside U.S. Trade, an expensive weekly newsletter, publishes many “confidential draft texts” which include GATT information. If all else fails, and the United States is a principal, call the U.S. Trade Representative at (202) 395-3150 to obtain de-restricted panel reports. If the United States is not a principal, contact trade associations, embassies, or foreign trade offices in the involved countries.


56. I am grateful to Ellen G. Shaffer, International and Foreign Law Librarian, Georgetown University Law Center, whose handouts and excellent lecture at the 1993 American Association of Law Librarians Institute, see supra note 25, are the principle source of my GATT knowledge. I relied heavily on her analysis and experience in the preparation of this section.


58. Basic Instruments and Selected Documents (Geneva: GATT, 1951-).


B. Online and Web Site Sources

The *BNA International Reporter* (available on Lexis in the INTLAW library, INTRAD file) is useful for tracking panel reports, although it does not contain the reports themselves.\(^62\) Another useful Lexis file in the INTLAW library is BDIEL (Basic Documents of International Economic Law).\(^63\)

The WTO has a Web site. It does not yet publish many documents but includes press releases. It is located at:

http://gatekeeper.unicc.org/wto/Welcome.html

C. Microfiche Sources

GATT documents not in *BISD* are in a microfiche collection usually called *GATT Documents*.\(^64\) This collection uses the complex GATT document numbering scheme, is expensive, and does not include restricted documents. A companion paper index provides access by document number, subject, country, and product.

VIII. Unification of Laws

Just as the European Union has sought to harmonize the laws under which its member states operate, other national legal systems have sought to standardize laws which impact transnational transactions. These efforts are generally incorporated in multilateral treaties, rather than national laws. *Germain's Transnational Legal Research* contains a good section on the substantive issues involved in unification and discusses the major international organizations involved in the harmonization of private international law, including the U.N. Commission on International Trade Law (UNCITRAL), the Hague Conference on Private International Law, the International Institute for Unification of Private International Law (UNIDROIT), and the Organization of American States (OAS).\(^65\)

A. The Hague Conference on Private International Law

The Hague Conference on Private International Law is very important to practitioners. This intergovernmental organization is over 100 years old and has forty-one Member States. The Conference drafts conventions on a variety of topics. The United States, which has been a member since

---

\(^62\) Use this search: title(gatt and panel).

\(^63\) To find panel reports, use this search: gatt and title(panel report) plus any other words the report might include.

\(^64\) The few libraries with this collection are listed in *Analytical Index*, *supra* note 57 (ordering information is also provided).

1963, is a party to the Hague Conventions on service of process abroad,\textsuperscript{66} on the taking of evidence abroad in civil or commercial matters,\textsuperscript{67} on abolishing the requirement of legalization for foreign public documents,\textsuperscript{68} and on the civil aspects of international child abduction.\textsuperscript{69} The United States signed but has not yet ratified the convention on the recognition of trusts.\textsuperscript{70} Of particular interest to U.S. practitioners is the convention on the enforcement of judgments, presently on the Conference’s agenda. The status of the Hague Conference conventions and the Conference membership is tracked in the second issue each year of the \textit{Netherlands International Law Review}.\textsuperscript{71}

\textbf{B. The International Institute for the Unification of Private Law}

The International Institute for the Unification of Private Law (UNIDROIT), an organization with fifty-six Member States, including the United States, is presently involved in a Restatement-like effort to harmonize and state principles of international law. Since the United States has not adopted any UNIDROIT texts, its texts are of little concern to U.S. practitioners. However, the increasing importance of international legal issues, such as probate, leasing, and factoring, may lead to U.S. adoption. UNIDROIT has an Internet home page at:

\begin{verbatim}
http://ananse.irv.uit.no/trade_law/nav/unidroit.html
\end{verbatim}

\textbf{C. The United Nations Commission on International Trade Law}

The United Nations Commission on International Trade Law (UNCITRAL) is in the process of attempting to restate current law and to propose new substantive law concerning international trade. UNCITRAL’s work in arbitration and sales law is well known: the United Nations Convention on Contracts for the International Sale of Goods,\textsuperscript{72} the UNCITRAL Arbitration Rules,\textsuperscript{73} and the Model Law on International

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{67} Hague Convention on the Taking of Evidence Abroad in Civil or Commercial Matters, 23 U.S.T. 2555, T.I.A.S. No. 7444.
\textsuperscript{71} \textit{NETHERLANDS INTERNATIONAL LAW REVIEW} (Dordrecht, Netherlands: Nijhoff, 1975-).
\end{footnotesize}

UNCITRAL has an official Web site now, located at:

http://www.un.or.at/uncitral/index.html

The centerpiece of this site is the collection of case law abstracts on UNCITRAL texts (CLOUT). The abstracts are written by national correspondents designated by their governments. CLOUT is part of the system which the Secretariat has established for compiling and disseminating information on court decisions and arbitral awards relating to UNCITRAL conventions and model laws. There is a user guide at the Web site.

One UNCITRAL convention, the Convention on Contracts for the International Sale of Goods (CISG) is the planned centerpiece of an exciting WWW site. The Institute of International Commercial Law at Pace Law School, directed by Nicholas Triffin, is creating an Internet version of a looseleaf service on the CISG. The project will bring together legislative history, a bibliography, cases interpreting the CISG, and scholarly commentary and articles. This massive undertaking, which includes the work of contributors from all over the world, should be available to the public in March 1996. The site will be located at:

http://cisci3.law.pace.edu
http://www.cisis.law.pace.edu

In addition, the Cornell International Law Journal will produce the first issue of The Review of the Convention on the International Sale of Goods in Winter 1995-96. This peer-reviewed journal, edited by the staff of the Cornell International Law Journal and published by Kluwer, is initially planned as an annual periodical containing articles, commentaries, case notes, book reviews, and research essays.

D. The Organization of American States

Documents from the Organization of American States (OAS), a sponsor of private international law conferences, have been difficult to obtain. The OAS has a WWW site which improves public access to its documentation:

http://www.oas.org/

Included here are the full-text of resolutions of the General Assembly and the Permanent Council from 1994 forward, what appear to be all the OAS treaties and its charter, the organization’s weekly calendar, announcements, press releases, and documents of other OAS ad hoc bodies. The materials are keyword searchable. Some are in Spanish and some are in English.

---

Although official records are generally in Spanish and in English, verbatim minutes are in the language of the speaker. The annual Analytic Index is in Spanish only. The United States is a party to two of the OAS treaties: the Inter-American Convention on International Commercial Arbitration, 75 and the 1975 Inter-American Convention on Letters Roga-
tory and 1979 Protocol. 76

E. Non-Governmental Organizations

Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) now number nearly 6000, and include such well-known organizations as Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch, and Greenpeace. Governments are often members of NGOs. A good general reference tool for identifying and locating NGOs is the Encyclopedia of Associations (National and International versions). 77 A good place to find NGOs is at this page in the WWW Yahoo directory:

http://www.yahoo.com/Economy/Organizations/Public_Interest_Groups/

IX. Treaties

A. Primary Treaty Collections: Current

Like other primary law sources, treaties are collected, indexed, and updated in various ways. The main treaty collections are (in order from most current to historical):

*International Legal Materials* (Washington, DC: The American Society of International Law, 1962-) (1982 to present on Lexis in INTLAW library, ILM file and 1980 to present on Westlaw, ILM database) (*ILM*). While this is not a comprehensive treaty collection, new treaties often appear here as print drafts or final texts. The November issue contains the annual index.

Igor I. Kavass & Mark A. Michael, *Hein's United States Treaties and Other International Agreements Current Service* (Buffalo, NY: Hein & Co., 1989-) (microfiche). Recent texts are arranged by KAV (or Kavass) numbers and Temporary State Department numbers, which are chronological. KAV numbers are a symbol, followed by a number, assigned for the temporary identification of treaties and agreements entered into by the United States after 1950 and not yet assigned a *Treaty and Other International Act Series* (*TIAS*) number. The Bluebook prefers KAV numbers if *UST* or *TIAS* numbers are not available. Hein's publishes treaties within eight weeks of receipt by Congress. While the index is on microfiche at the end of the set, other treaty indexes also provide the KAV number. Hein is in the process of incorporating documents from the mid-1980s.

77. ENCYCLOPEDIA OF ASSOCIATIONS (Detroit: Gale Research Co., 1961- (National) & 1989- (International)).
Consolidated Treaties and International Agreements (Dobbs Ferry, NY: Oceana Publications, 1989-). The full text of treaties are published here within ninety days of receipt by Congress from the Department of State. Access is by department number, country, and subject. Treaties in this publication are available on Lexis in the INTLAW library, TREATIES file, but not for academic subscriptions. The full text of treaties are also in Oceana's TIARA CD-ROM treaty index.

USTREATIES database on Westlaw. Coverage of slip treaties obtained directly from the U.S. Department of State goes back to 1979 (TIAS No. 10869), with a time lag from signing of approximately two months. This database is available on the law school subscription.

Multilaterals Project of the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy at Tufts University:

http://www.tufts.edu/fletcher/multilaterals.html

This site contains the full-text of selected current and historical treaties. It includes a chronological index and is keyword searchable.

European Yearbook (The Hague: Nijhoff, 1955-). This yearbook annually reprints all major European in-force treaties. It runs two to three years behind.

United States Treaties and Other International Agreements (Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1950-) (UST). UST is the authoritative and permanent citation for U.S. treaties and is published by the Department of State. One can expect a twelve-year delay in publication.

United Nations Treaty Series (UNTS) (New York: United Nations, 1946/47-) The U.N. Charter requires every member country of the United Nations to register its treaties with the Secretariat, which will publish the treaties in UNTS. Arrangement is by the date of registration, not date of ratification or signature. Since delays are common, and some countries don't comply, locating treaties can be difficult. Treaties are indexed within each set through 1970; it is easier to find multilateral treaties through Multilateral Treaties Deposited with the Secretary General.

Treaties and Other International Acts Series (Washington, DC: Department of State, 1946-). TIAS contains the temporary slip form of treaties until they are published in UST. One can expect a seven to ten year delay.

B. Historical Collections

Treaties and Other International Agreements of the United States of America, 1776-1949 (Washington, DC: U.S. Department of State, Charles Bevans, ed., 1968-). This is the most complete collection of pre-1950 U.S. treaties.

United States Statutes at Large (Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1937-). This is the official citation to U.S. treaties before 1950. Volume 8 has all treaties from 1776-1845 and volume 64, part 3 (1950-51) indexes all international agreements in Statutes at Large.

Consolidated Treaty Series (Dobbs Ferry, NY: Oceana Publications, C. Parry ed., 1969-81). This is the most complete historical collection of world treaties going back to 1648 and continuing up to 1920 when the League of Nations Treaty Series begins.

Unperfected Treaties of the United States, 1776-1976 (Dobbs Ferry, NY: Oceana Publications, C. Wiktor ed., 1976-). Use this series to locate treaties to which the United States was a signatory, but which never went into force. The series includes legislative history and commentary.

C. Collections of Other Countries

Many nations have their own collections of national treaties; for a partial list, see Guide to International Legal Research.78

D. Main Treaty Indexes

United States Treaty Index: 1776-1990 Consolidation (Buffalo, NY: Hein & Co., Igor Kavass ed., 1991). This is a comprehensive index of all treaties and agreements entered into by the United States from 1776 to 1990. The work consists of a numerically-arranged master guide containing full descriptions of each treaty and agreement, a chronological index, a country index which includes international organizations, and a subject index. Supplements contain more recent treaties and include cumulative Supplement 1 and the semi-annual cumulative Current Treaty Indexes (which include tables for converting KAV to TIAS numbers and vice versa).

Hein's U.S. Treaty Index on CD-ROM (Buffalo, NY: W.S. Hein Co.). This source reproduces Hein's United States Treaties Index: 1776-1990 and supplements. The search engine is the nonintuitive PREMISE software. If you have not used PREMISE before, make sure that you have written instructions and expect some frustration. This is an index only, and there are no full-text treaties.

Multilateral Treaties: Index and Current Status (London: Butterworths, M.J. Bowman & D.J. Harris eds., 1984) (supplement published by Nottingham Treaty Centre). This chronological arrangement indexes major multilateral treaties and gives dates of conclusion, signing, and entry into force, in addition to parties, reservations, and useful notes about the scope and any amending force of the treaties. The work includes a list of multilateral treaties not given full treatment, and subject and word indexes. I use this index more than any other.

78. GUIDE, supra note 3, at 75.
Treaties in Force (Washington: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1941-) (annual). This is the first place to check to determine whether a U.S. treaty is in force. Bilateral agreements are listed alphabetically by country, with agreements categorized by broad subject categories within each country. Multilateral treaties are arranged by subject only, and the subjects for bilateral and multilateral treaties are not always the same. Searching by subject is usually difficult. The Guide to United States Treaties in Force or the U.S. Treaty Index are usually easier for subject searches.

Igor Kavass & Adolf Sprudzs, Guide to United States Treaties in Force (Buffalo, NY: W.S. Hein Co., 1982-) (annual). Part I categorizes treaties numerically and by subject. Part II has a chronological index of multilateral treaties and an index by country. The work includes only treaties currently in force to which the United States is a party.


World Treaty Index (Santa Barbara, CA: ABC-Clio, Peter Rohn ed., 3d ed. 1983-84). This is an index of world treaties from 1900-1980. It has no supplement and is difficult to use but does include many non-U.S. treaties.


E. Finding Treaties by Subject
Try these methods to locate treaties on a topic:

1) Search by subject in the treaty indexes listed above. Make sure the index matches your search constraints (i.e., bilateral, multilateral, specific countries).

2) Search by title, subject, or keyword on a library catalog or other database to find individual treaties. Utilize other treaty collections by subject, country, or time period, and commercial looseleafs on a subject. "Treaties" is a Library of Congress subject heading. Under the subject headings for specific wars or countries there is a "treaties" subdivision (e.g., World War II 1939-1945—treaties).

3) Search International Legal Materials on Lexis or Westlaw by word.

4) Examples of Treaty Collections by Topic:
Tax Treaties (Chicago: Commerce Clearing House, 1990-). This looseleaf has texts of tax treaties and proposed treaties.


Human Rights Library Web Site at the University of Minnesota which contains texts of treaties and other documents:

http://www.umn.edu/humanrts

International Environment Reporter (Washington, DC: Bureau of National Affairs, 1978-). This source provides the texts of treaties and lists signatures. The Current Reports are online, but the useful Reference Files section, which prints the actual documents, is not.

F. Updating Treaties

It may be difficult to determine whether your research has fully updated a treaty. Here are some tips and methods for updating treaties. First, see what you can get from the print and online sources listed in this section and check the dates of the texts. The most current information may not be in print. You may need to call someone at one of the government numbers listed below.

Updating tools include:

Treaties in Force. Update with U.S. Department of State Dispatch section entitled “Treaties—Current Actions” or on Lexis in INTLAW library, DSTATE file (from 1984). To find the treaty actions sections, use “treaty actions” as a search term.

International Legal Materials. “Recent Actions” section (on Lexis in INTLAW library, ILM file from 1982). Use this search: section(recent actions regarding treaties)

Multilateral Treaties Deposited with the Secretary General. Update this with the U.N. Chronicle.

Shepard’s U.S. Citations, Treaty Section. Contains citations to federal cases interpreting treaties, statutes affecting treaties, and amendments by later treaties. State court citations to treaties are in state citators.

Multilateral Treaties: Index and Current Status. The supplements provide new signatories and reservations information.

Netherlands International Law Review. This updates Hague Conference conventions.

Government offices:
Assistant Legal Adviser for Treaty Affairs
United States Department of State
(202) 647-2044

Information on status of treaty negotiations and post-ratification developments:
Senate Committee on Foreign Relations
Reservations, which are frequently adopted by participating countries and limit treaty participation, are critical elements of a treaty. Reservations are listed in standard sources, but the texts may be difficult to obtain. For treaties deposited with the United Nations, reservations are printed in Multilateral Treaties Deposited with the Secretary-General. If not there, trade treaty reservations may be obtained at the International Trade Law Home Page, or by calling either the government offices listed above, if the United States is a party, or the consular representatives of the countries involved.

Country desks in the Department of Commerce may be able to help with treaties affecting business. Consulates for foreign countries are listed in The Legal Researcher's Desk Reference and in the Statesman's Year-Book.

A few last tips and tricks with treaties are worth mentioning. When I have identified a treaty but cannot find a citation, I search Lexis in the LAWREV library, ALLREV file or the Westlaw TP-ALL database to find a citation. ILM contains many useful treaties. The table of contents for upcoming issues (as well as table of contents for the American Journal of International Law) are posted on INT-LAW, the Internet "listserv" where international and foreign research issues are discussed. In addition, The Electronic Newstand is a free source of ILM tables of contents and selected materials. It is located at:

gopher://gopher.enews.com:70/11/magazines/alphabetic/gi/ilm

Conclusion

This essay contains information I picked up over time, had to learn to perform my job competently, and enjoyed learning. My goal is to offer novice international researchers enough information to recognize and find basic international documents, and to know where to go for more information.

79. Ananse Internasjonal Handelsrets Prospekt (Ananse International Trade Law Project):
http://ananse.irv.uit.no/trade_law/nav/trade.html
80. These are listed in BUSINESS AMERICA (Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Commerce, 1978-).
81. LEGAL RESEARCHER'S DESK REFERENCE (Teaneck, NJ: Infosources, Arlene L. Eis ed., 1990-).
82. THE STATESMAN'S YEAR-BOOK (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1864-).
83. To sign up for INT-LAW, send an e-mail message to this address: listserv@vm1.spcs.umn.edu
The message should have nothing in the subject line, but should contain this message: subscribe intlaw
If you don't get a response message that day, send it again.